



# YOUTH AND THE CRIMINAL JUSTICE SYSTEM

Professor Janet E. Mosher  
Sept. 1990

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Social Work and Law, University of Toronto.

Special thanks to Cathy Taylor for all of her assistance in preparing these materials and to Professor Nicholas Bala and Professor Don Stuart for their kind permission to include portions from their text, Canadian Children's Law: A Coursebook.

Sept 1990

K.F.  
9779  
M67  
1990

LAW LIBRARY

OCT 18 1990

FACULTY OF LAW  
UNIVERSITY OF TORONTO


YOUTH AND THE CRIMINAL  
JUSTICE SYSTEM

Professor Janet E. Mosher  
Sept. 1990

Notice: These materials are distributed solely for classroom use by students of the Faculties of Social Work and Law, University of Toronto.

Special thanks to Cathy Taylor for all of her assistance in preparing these materials and to Professor Nicholas Bala and Professor Don Stuart for their kind permission to include portions from their text, Canadian Children's Law: A Coursebook.

Sept 1990



Digitized by the Internet Archive  
in 2018 with funding from  
University of Toronto

<https://archive.org/details/youthcriminaljus00mosh>

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

|   | <u>Page</u> |
|---|-------------|
| <u>PART 1</u>   |             |
| <u>THE JUVENILE JUSTICE REGIME</u>  |             |
| <br>Chapter One: Legal Responses to Juvenile Crime                                | <br>1       |
| A) An Overview  | 1           |
| Bala, "The Young Offenders Act: Why a New Era in Juvenile Justice?"               | 1           |
| B) Historical Underpinnings   | 11          |
| (i) The Concept of "Childhood"  | 11          |
| Empey, <u>American Delinquency: Its Meaning and Construction</u>                  | 11          |
| (ii) The Juvenile Court   | 22          |
| Fox, "The Treatment of Juveniles in Canadian Criminal Law"                        | 22          |
| (iii) Gestures of Humanity or of Social Control?                                  | 28          |
| <u>Re Gault</u>   | 28          |
| Platt, <u>The Child Savers</u>  | 30          |
| Empey, <u>American Delinquency: Its Meaning and Construction</u>                  | 35          |
| C) Growing Disillusionment with the J.D.A.  | 37          |
| (i) The Treatment Debate  | 37          |
| L.C. Wilson, "Parens Patriae: The Unfulfilled Promise"                            | 37          |
| "Unfortunately there is such a thing as a bad boy"                                | 38          |
| J. Wilson, <u>Thinking About Crime</u>  | 40          |
| Conly, "A Critique of the Institutional Response to Juvenile Delinquency"         | 48          |
| Leschied, "Evaluating Conflicts Between Intention and Outcome"                    | 51          |
| Farrington, "Implications of Longitudinal Studies For Social Prevention"          | 62          |
| "Safety of cities linked to troubled, poor youth"                                 | 66          |
| "Fighting the Failure Syndromes"  | 67          |
| MacKillop and Clarke, "Safer Tomorrows Begin Today"                               | 68          |
| "Frequent spankings cited as cause of delinquency"                                | 77          |
| "New wave of teen gangs preys on subways, schools and stores"                     | 78          |
| "Unloved teens join street gangs"   | 81          |
| (ii) The Due Process Debate   | 82          |
| Catton, "Models of Procedure and the Juvenile Courts"                             | 82          |
| Fox, "The Treatment of Juveniles in Canadian Law"                                 | 88          |
| <u>Re Gault</u>   | 89          |
| Corrado and Markwart, "The Prices of Rights and Responsibilities"                 | 91          |
| Greenspan, "The Dilemma of Due Process"   | 103         |
| (iii) Children's Rights   | 104         |
| Chisholm, "Towards A Position on Children's Rights"                               | 104         |
| Minow, "Rights for the Next Generation: A Feminist Approach to Children's Rights" | 109         |
| Draft Convention on the Rights of the Child                                       | 121         |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Chapter Two: Jurisdiction Based on Age                                 | 123 |
| A) Upper Age Limit   | 124 |
| (i) Provincial Concerns  | 125 |
| (ii) Provincial Responses  | 128 |
| Ontario Social Development Council                                     | 128 |
| "Ottawa judge fears provincial decision"                               | 139 |
| "New youth act puts more in jail for longer terms"                     | 139 |
| <u>R. v. R.C.</u>  | 141 |
| "Ontario court backlogs cited as factor in custody rulings"            | 145 |
| B) Proof of Age  | 146 |
| (i) Actual Age   | 147 |
| (ii) Apparent Age  | 148 |
| <u>R. v. Pilkington</u>  | 149 |
| C) Minimum Age for Criminal Responsibility                             | 153 |
| Leschied and Wilson, "Criminal Liability of Children Under Twelve"     | 154 |
| Peterson, "Children's Understanding of the Juvenile Justice System"    | 157 |
| Group for the Advancement of Psychiatry, <u>How Old is Old Enough?</u> | 169 |
| "Law Courts Spawn Fagins, Officials Fear"                              | 171 |
| <u>Child and Family Services Act</u>                                   | 173 |
| Chapter Three: Conduct Attracting a Legal Response                     | 175 |
| A) Offence Jurisdiction  | 175 |
| B) Morality and Disposition Jurisdiction                               | 176 |
| Wadlington, <u>Children in the Legal System</u>                        | 177 |
| Dept. of Justice Committee, <u>Juvenile Delinquency in Canada</u>      | 180 |
| "25% of alleged sex offenders under 18"                                | 182 |
| C) Pornography and Prostitution  | 183 |
| Badgley, Sexual Offences Against Children                              | 183 |
| Fraser, <u>Pornography and Prostitution in Canada</u>                  | 187 |
| D) Truancy   | 199 |
| <u>Re L.K.</u>   | 199 |
| Leschied and Jaffee, "Implementing the Y.O.A. in Ontario"              | 202 |
| Chapter Four: Extra-Judicial Responses                                 | 205 |
| A) Formally Recognized Procedures                                      | 205 |
| (Alternative Measures)   |     |
| (i) Introduction   | 205 |
| (ii) Section 4 Y.O.A.  | 207 |
| "Detaining the young"  | 209 |



|   |     |
|---|-----|
| <u>R. v. S.S.</u>   | 210 |
| Bala and Lilles, <u>Young Offenders Act Annotated</u>                     | 214 |
| Moyer, "Diversion from the Juvenile Justice System"                       | 215 |
| <u>R. v. J.B.</u>   | 216 |
| (iii) Effect of Alternative Measures on Young Offenders                   | 218 |
| Morton and West, <u>An Experiment in Diversion by a Citizen Committee</u> | 219 |
| B) Informal Procedures  | 228 |
| Chapter Five: The Juvenile Court Hearing                                  | 231 |
| A) Pre-Hearing Issues   | 231 |
| (i) Applicable Procedure  | 232 |
| "Brief of The Manitoba Society on Criminology"                            | 233 |
| (ii) Exclusive Jurisdiction of the Youth Court                            | 234 |
| (iii) Notice of Hearings  | 235 |
| <u>R. v. L.</u>   | 236 |
| <u>R. v. F.G.</u>   | 238 |
| (iv) Arrest and Detention   | 239 |
| (a) Rights Arising Upon Arrest and Detention                              | 239 |
| <u>R. v. James Michael G.</u>   | 240 |
| <u>R. v. H.</u>   | 242 |
| <u>R. v. Shannon H.</u>   | 244 |
| <u>R. v. Ina Christina V.</u>   | 246 |
| (b) Temporary Restraint   | 249 |
| (c) Judicial Interim Release  | 249 |
| (d) Detention for Medical Reports   | 250 |
| <u>R. v. D.S.</u>   | 250 |
| <u>R. v. J.M.</u>   | 251 |
| (e) Pre-Trial Detention   | 254 |
| (f) Availability of Detention Facilities                                  | 255 |
| Department of Justice Committee on Juvenile Delinquency                   | 255 |
| <u>Re Jacey Ann B.</u>  | 256 |
| "Ontario judge stresses importance of bail in young offender system"      | 258 |
| B) Adjudication   | 259 |
| (i) Rights of the Young Person  | 259 |
| (a) Right to Counsel  | 259 |
| <u>R. v. Ronald H.</u>  | 260 |
| "Use of criminal lawyers in youth courts assailed"                        | 261 |
| "Judges' stand"   | 262 |
| "Judge's comments bring slap on wrist"                                    | 263 |
| (ii) Special Considerations   | 264 |
| (a) Privacy   | 264 |
| <u>Southam Inc. v. The Queen</u>  | 266 |
| Campbell, "Feathers in the Aquarium"                                      | 274 |
| (b) Pleas   | 275 |
| "Judge concerned guilty pleas unfair"                                     | 275 |
| (c) Records   | 276 |
| Platt, <u>Young Offenders Law in Canada</u>                               | 278 |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| Chapter Six: Transfer Proceedings                                    | 281 |
| "Boy, 13, is found guilty of murdering 2 women"                      | 283 |
| A) Initiation of Proceedings   | 284 |
| B) Factors Relevant to Transfer                                      | 285 |
| <u>R. v. Mark Andrew Z.</u>  | 286 |
| <u>R. v. W.S.</u>  | 294 |
| "S.C.C. guidance for transfer to adult court"                        | 297 |
| "A truly offensive act"  | 300 |
| Dept. of Justice - Bill C-58   | 301 |
| Canadian Council on Children and Youth, "A Response to Bill C-58"    | 303 |
| Besta and Wintemute, "Young offenders in adult court"                | 319 |
| "Tough youth law misses the mark"                                    | 322 |
| "Ont. teen's murder trial is transferred to adult court"             | 323 |
| Chapter Seven: Issues of Race and Gender                             | 324 |
| A) First Nations Peoples   | 324 |
| Report of the Race Relations and Policing Task Force                 | 324 |
| "Report on Marshall case finds racism widespread"                    | 329 |
| "In vindication of Donald Marshall"                                  | 330 |
| "Group justice is no justice at all"                                 | 331 |
| LaPrairie, "The Young Offenders Act and Aboriginal Youth"            | 332 |
| Jackson, "Locking Up Natives"  | 339 |
| Monture, "A Vicious Circle: Child Welfare and the First Nations"     | 341 |
| Little, "Special Types of Young Offenders"                           | 347 |
| B) Police and Visible Minority Communities                           | 352 |
| "Police under fire"  | 352 |
| Task Force Report  | 354 |
| "Reforms in effect"  | 365 |
| Bill 107   | 365 |
| C) Delinquency and Gender  | 367 |
| Langelier-Biron, "The Delinquent Young Girl: A Non-Entity"           | 367 |
| Barnhorst, "Female Delinquency and the Role of Women"                | 378 |
| Barnhorst, <u>Female Delinquency and the Juvenile Justice System</u> | 385 |
| Chapter Eight: Disposition of the Young Offender                     | 387 |
| A) Introduction  | 387 |
| B) Procedure and Evidence  | 388 |
| <u>R. v. Gardiner</u>  | 388 |
| <u>R. v. R.I.</u>  | 390 |
| Ontario Social Development Council                                   | 394 |
| C) Dispositional Alternatives  | 395 |
| (i) Discharges   | 397 |



|   |         |
|---|---------|
| (ii) Fines  | 399     |
| (iii) Compensation, Restitution and Community Service Orders                  | 400     |
| Bala and Lilles, <u>Young Offenders Act Annotated</u>                         | 401     |
| Ontario Social Development Council  | 404     |
| (iv) Prohibition  | 407     |
| (v) Detention for Treatment   | 407     |
| Kittrie, <u>The Right to be Different</u>                                     | 408     |
| Family Court Clinic Brief   | 411     |
| "Young Offenders Act 'almost anticlinical'"                                   | 413     |
| (vi) Probation  | 415     |
| Ontario Social Development Council  | 416     |
| <u>R. v. T.L.</u>   | 419     |
| (vii) Custody   | 421     |
| Blovin, "Disposition Hearing Strategy"  | 422     |
| <u>Re D.B. and The Queen</u>  | 426     |
| <u>R. v. Gordon J.</u>  | 427     |
| <u>R. v. B.D.</u>   | 428     |
| Selected Statistics on Custody  | 430     |
| Winterdyk and Roesch, "A Wilderness Experimental Program"                     | 431     |
| <u>R. v. R.I.</u>   | 434     |
| <u>R. v. M.B.</u>   | 437     |
| <u>R.R. v. R.</u>   | 440     |
| <u>R. v. G.K.</u>   | 441     |
| "Boy, 13, who killed two women gets maximum sentence"                         | 442     |
| (viii) Other Reasonable Conditions  | 444     |
| (ix) Dispositions Not Included  | 445     |
| <br>D) Determining Dispositions   | <br>446 |
| (i) Assessment and Diagnosis: The Role of Professionals                       | 446     |
| (a) Section 13  | 446     |
| Bala and Lilles, <u>The Young Offenders Act Annotated</u>                     | 447     |
| Awad and Chamberlain, "The Process of Psychiatric Work"                       | 452     |
| (b) Pre-Disposition Reports   | 457     |
| Hanscom, The Dynamics of Disposition  | 462     |
| (ii) Judicial Discretion  | 468     |
| Hanscom, The Dynamics of Disposition  | 469     |
| (iii) Treatment and its Effectiveness   | 480     |
| Shamsie, "Anti-Social Adolescents: Our Treatments Do Not Work"                | 481     |
| <br>Chapter Nine: The Role of the Lawyer, Prosecutor, Judge and Social Worker | <br>488 |
| <br>A) The Role of the Defence Lawyer   | <br>488 |
| Law Society of Upper Canada Sub-Committee Report                              | 491     |
| Alexander, "Constitutional Rights in Juvenile Court"                          | 492     |
| Komar, "The Criminal Domestication of the Juvenile Delinquents Act"           | 493     |
| Bogen, "Beating the Rap in Juvenile Court"                                    | 494     |
| Isaacs, "The Role of the Lawyer Representing Minors"                          | 497     |
| Catton and Erickson, "The Juvenile's Perception of the Role of                |         |

|  |     |
|--|-----|
| the Defence Counsel"   | 499 |
| Hanscom, The Dynamics of Disposition   | 505 |
| Peters, "Concrete Strategies for Managing Ethically-Based Conflicts"           | 513 |
| Rules of Professional Conduct  | 517 |
| B) Capacity to Retain and Instruct Counsel                                     | 520 |
| Leon, "Recent Developments in Legal Representation of Children"                | 520 |
| <u>R. v. Wayne W.W.</u>  | 527 |
| Law Society of Upper Canada Sub-Committee Report                               | 528 |
| C) The Role of the Prosecutor  | 528 |
| Grosman, "Young Offenders Before the Courts"                                   | 529 |
| Fish, "Bill C-192: Another View"   | 530 |
| <u>Boucher v. The Queen</u>  | 531 |
| D) The Role of the Judge   | 532 |
| Bala, "Comment on <u>Smith v. Zeiger</u> "                                     | 533 |
| The Royal Commission Inquiry into Civil Rights                                 | 536 |
| MacAskill and Andrews, "The Role of the Youth Court Judge"                     | 537 |
| <br><u>PART TWO</u>  |     |
| <u>CHILDREN AS VICTIMS</u>   |     |
| Chapter Ten: The Abuse of Children   | 539 |
| Underwood, "The Abuse of Children"   | 539 |
| Chapter Eleven: Children as Witnesses  | 543 |
| A) Reliability of Children's Evidence  | 543 |
| Bessner, "The Competency of the Child Witness"                                 | 543 |
| Yuille, "The Systematic Assessment of Children's Testimony"                    | 555 |
| Goodman, "Children's Testimony in Historical Perspective"                      | 563 |
| Amiel, "A questionable witness to abuse"                                       | 566 |
| Gelman, "The Sex-Abuse Puzzle"   | 567 |
| Makin, "Listening to the Children"   | 569 |
| B) A Less Intimidating Environment   | 571 |
| Bala, "Double Victims: Child Sexual Abuse"                                     | 571 |
| Stewart and Bala, "Understanding Criminal Prosecutions for Child Sexual Abuse" | 588 |
| <u>Coy v. Iowa</u>   | 593 |
| <u>R. v. Levogiannis</u>   | 601 |
| <u>R. v. Thompson</u>  | 605 |
| C) Expert Evidence   | 611 |
| Vogl and Bala, "Testifying on Behalf of Children"                              | 611 |
| <u>R. v. F.E.J.</u>  | 615 |
| D) Innovative Programs to Assist Child Witnesses                               | 619 |
| Jaffe et al., "Court Testimony of Child Sexual Abuse Victims"                  | 619 |
| Court Ordeals For Children: A Need For Innovative Programs                     | 623 |